CONTINENTAL COST BENEFIT ANALYSIS (CBA) FOR UTILIZATION OF GNSS APPLICATIONS AND IMPLEMENTATION OF SBAS SERVICES IN AFRICA.

by

Engr. Lasisi Salami LAWAL (PhD, CEng)

lasisi@nigcomsat.gov.ng

Nigerian Communications Satellite Ltd.
Obasanjo Space Center, Lugbe, Abuja.

Federal Ministry of Communications and Digital Economy, Nigeria

For

United Nations International Meeting on the Applications of Global Navigation Satellite Systems, Vienna, Austria. 5-9 December, 2022
CONTENTS

- Abstract
- Introduction
- Needs and Gap Assessment of GNSS/SBAS in Africa (Aviation Sector)
- Needs and Gap Assessment of GNSS/SBAS in Africa (Non-Aviation Sector)
- SBAS Applications in Aviation
- SBAS/GNSS Applications in Non-Aviation Sectors
- Continental Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) in Aviation Sector
- Continental Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) in Non-Aviation Sector (Maritime & Agriculture)
- Overall Continental Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA)
- Recommendations and Conclusion
- References
INTRODUCTION (Abstract)

Utilization of Global Navigation Satellite System (GNSS) is increasingly becoming important to fast track considerable attainments of United Nations Sustainable Development Goals beyond Positioning, Navigation and Timing (PNT). In consideration of the importance of GNSS applications, nations and regions are investing and adopting its services as an emerging technology for adaptation. African continent is not left out and Satellite Based Augmentation (SBAS); a less ambitious system than GNSS is a satellite-based system that aids a Global Navigation Satellite System (GNSS) in providing further accuracy, integrity, availability to positioning, navigation, and timing in the aviation sector that involves safety of life (SOL) with verified performance on integrity of signal-in-space (SiS) and increasing applications and services in non-aviation sectors such as maritime, rail & road transport, oil & sector, agriculture, safety of public infrastructure such as dams, bridges & high-rise buildings, survey, civil engineering, mass market applications, atmospheric weather & landslide monitoring, among others. The paper provides some insights, summary and outcome on Continental Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) of implementation of SBAS in Africa organized recently by African Union Commission (AUC) and African Civil Aviation commission (AFCAC); specialized arm of African Union (AU) on aviation matters with takeaways and recommendations to African member states including need for stakeholders and specialized institutions to embrace capacity building, awareness and sensitization activities to encourage rapid adoption of SBAS applications in aviation and non-aviation sectors.
INTRODUCTION (NIGCOMSAT-1R as a Hybrid Satellite)

NIGCOMSAT-1R is a hybrid satellite with a Navigation (L-Band) payload for a Space Based Augmentation System meant to provide a Navigation Overlay Service (NOS) similar to the European Geostationary Navigation Overlay Service (EGNOS).
NEEDS AND GAP ASSESSMENT OF GNSS IN AFRICA
(Aviation Sector)

➢ In aviation, the instrument landing system (ILS) is a radio navigation system that provides short-range guidance to aircraft to allow them to approach a runway at night or in bad weather safely.

➢ Africa has numerous airports without ILS or alternative GNSS-based approach procedures.

➢ The Airports may have:
  ▪ No ILS equipment but alternative GNSS-based RNP approaches
  ▪ No ILS equipment nor GNSS-based RNP approaches

- For either of these cases, **SBAS offers substantial advantages:**
  - **SBAS** deployment on a continental level would allow for **CAT-I approaches on all runway ends**, greatly enhancing the **safety** and **operational efficiency** in the approach phase

- Even at **airports with existing RNP APCH procedures**, **SBAS offers lower decision heights and safety** benefits i.e.: Terminal Maneuvering Area (TMA), Delays, Diversions and Cancellations (DDC) avoidance, CFIT (Controlled Flight into Terrain) / Landing accident avoidance, Mid-air collision avoidance etc.
NEEDS AND GAP ASSESSMENT OF GNSS IN AFRICA
(Aviation Sector: Current Airport Infrastructure & Procedures)

Continental Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) on SBAS Implementation in Africa; 30th May, 2022

Note: Locations of airports within each country are illustrative

© African Union Commission (AUC)
NEEDS AND GAP ASSESSMENT OF GNSS IN AFRICA
(Aviation Sector: Current Airport Infrastructure & Procedures)

Continental Cost Benefit Analysis (CBA) on SBAS Implementation in Africa; 30th May, 2022

© African Union Commission (AUC)
NEEDS & GAP ASSESSMENT IN NON-AVIATION SECTOR
Needs Assessment of GNSS/SBAS Applications in Farmers/Herders Clashes, Cattle Rustling etc
Needs Assessment of GNSS/SBAS Applications in Kidnap Menace
Needs Assessment of GNSS/SBAS Applications in Careless Road Accidents
Needs Assessment of GNSS/SBAS Applications in Anti-Car Theft and Fleet Management
Needs Assessment of GNSS/SBAS Applications in High-Rise Buildings
Needs Assessment of GNSS/SBAS Applications in Bridges, Dams etc
Needs Assessment of GNSS/SBAS Applications in Ship Piracy, Tracking and Monitoring
Needs Assessment of GNSS/ SBAS Applications in Fuel Smuggling and Diversion
Some Figures and Statistics

- Recurrent conflict between farmers and herdsmen in North-Central costs Nigeria at least $14 billion in potential revenues based on a new study conducted by a Global Humanitarian Organization; Mercy Corps funded by DFID.

- Nigeria is ranked worse than Mexico, Iraq, Russia and Indonesia among the top five countries most plagued by oil theft. Nigeria’s losses to crude theft is estimated to be $1.7bn monthly as at 2014.

- Lagos Command of the Nigerian Police reported 542 Vehicles stolen etc in Lagos alone between December 2015 and November 2016.
SBAS/GNSS APPLICATIONS

ON THE ROAD

ON THE WATER

ON THE TRAIN

ON THE AIR

GOING MOBILE

ON THE FARM

ON THE MAP

DURING AN EMERGENCY
Exponential development of SBAS services in the world with growing acknowledgement by airspace users.

We are working with relevant stakeholders in the aviation sector on SBAS initiative and program to help define the way SBAS system, should be deployed at best for the needs of the continent progressively.

Most aircrafts expected to be SBAS capable from 2030. However, retrofit solutions are currently available at lower cost.

Reduced and simplified equipment on board aircraft: SBAS airborne equipment acquisition, integration and installation costs is very minimal.

Flight crew training costs (≈ 0).

To encourage awareness and adoption of SBAS Technology for Navigation in Aviation sector, we will continue to showcase its importance with partners to stakeholders by conducting SBAS Flight demonstration across African countries (Francophone and Anglophone countries in Africa).
Maritime

- Ocean navigation
- Port approaches
- Restricted waters guidance
- Auto docking
Train Transportation

- Automatic tracking and inspections.
- The prevention of collisions, derailments, work zone incursions, and rail switch errors.
- Automatic speed control / braking
- The increasing of capacity and efficiency for all rail users.
- Position control, loading and unloading operations
STRUCTURAL DEFORMATION MONITORING
SERVICES IN BRIDGES & HIGH RISE
For the high precision applications, the GNSS/SBAS terminals with sub-meter level position accuracy can be used for land surveying, slide, etc.
Road Transportation

- Vehicle Tracking, Fleet Management and Integration with GIS systems
- Demographic Information
- Tolling
- Telematics, Tolling
- Traffic Management
- Intelligent Transport System (ITS)
- Timing System
- Anti-Collision System
Road Transportation: Alternative to Speed Limiters & Drivers’ License Issuance

- Monitoring and penalizing defaulters on speed limit.
- For Training and Certifying Could-be Drivers and Affirmation of Drivers’ Skill Test.
- Remote Monitoring/Supervision from a distance. i.e. From control center.
Oil & Gas Sector

- Fuel level monitoring
- Vehicle positioning and scheduling
- Vehicle crossing alarming
- Image monitoring

Oil & GAS

- Pipeline surveying and mapping
- Leak detection
- Real time monitoring

UAV Solutions
APPLICATIONS IN PRECISION AGRICULTURE

- Automatic harvesting
- Farmland planning
- Automatic water spray
- Enhances estimate on output of grains
- UAV spraying
- Agricultural machinery automatic navigation system
APPLICATIONS IN AGRICULTURE AND LIVESTOCK

Livestock

- Geo-fencing
- Tracking
- Detection of Diseases

Agriculture

- Precision Farming
- Precise Mechanical Control
- Crop Monitoring
ASSETS AND STAFF MONITORING

- Vehicle Tracking, Staff & Fleet management with integrated GIS system.
- Demographic Information of Assets
- Solution for real-time monitoring
OTHER GNSS/SBAS APPLICATIONS ARE:


➢ Improved Emergency Services, Recovery Services, Search & Rescue: Emergency Agencies, Fire Fighters, Road Safety Agencies: Guidance rescue operations etc.

➢ Utility Management: Energy and Communications Company for synchronization.

➢ Geographic Information System Companies

➢ Tourism

➢ Telematic Services i.e Insurance Companies

➢ Environmental Protection, Characterization and Demography

➢ Paramilitary Organizations, Security Agencies: Positioning and timing for field operations

➢ Emergency Warning systems

➢ Scientific Research
CONTINENTAL
COST
BENEFIT
ANALYSIS
(CBA)
THE SBAS SYSTEM HAS BEEN ANALYSED IN TERMS OF PERFORMANCES, SIGNAL AVAILABILITIES, GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE, SYSTEM ARCHITECTURE AND COST

SBAS system overview

System architecture

The SBAS system is made up of the

- **Ground Segment**: Ranging and Integrity Monitoring Stations, Mission Control Centre and Navigation Land-Earth Stations
- **Space Segment**: Geostationary satellites to broadcast signal to user
- **User segment**: Final user that takes advantage of SBAS signal

Cost of system deployment

The end-to-end cost of SBAS implementation in Africa has been benchmarking current operational systems and considers:

- SBAS infrastructure deployment
- Programme development
- Service Provision

Key finding

CAPEX: 191-221 M$  
OPEX: 18.2-20.5 M$/year

System performance and availability

Research on the current SBAS system performance (EGNOS) results in a 99.16% LPV-200 availability in 99% of the system’s service area

Governance

The future SBAS service in Africa can be a combination of ongoing initiatives (NIGCOMSAT, EGNOSv3, A-SBAS, etc), which can be complementary and based on a common system architecture.

Sources: Consultant’s analysis, Memorandum on Galileo and EGNOS (EU Commission), Status Report of FAA acquisitions (US Department of Transportation); ASECNA evaluation
IN ORDER TO QUANTIFY THE BENEFITS OF SBAS, A DETAILED COMPARISON WITH RESPECT TO OTHER ALTERNATIVE NAVIGATION TECHNOLOGIES HAS BEEN MADE

SBAS comparison with alternative technologies

- The study has concluded in considerable performance advantages of SBAS versus BaroVNAV equipage in terms of procedure approach minima
- The provision of geometric guidance, as opposed to barometric, is also considered a key factor in terms of safety by institutions such as ICAO’s NSP, IFALPA and IATA’s JURG

- ILS CAT-I and SBAS approaches can be considered operational equivalents, having SBAS superior service availability after stakeholder consultation (97.15% vs 99.16%)
- SBAS has an opportunity to provide CAT-I service to ILS-unequipped airports, to rationalise the ILS network or to provide contingency services in ILS-equipped aerodromes

- GBAS and SBAS are complementary solutions for Africa in the long term
  - DFMC GBAS to provide CAT II/III approaches in large airports upon operational need (=2035)
  - SBAS to provide CAT I approaches at all airports regardless of size, at all times

Key finding:
From a technological point of view, **SBAS has been identified as a key system** that can **fill a gap** currently existing in the African aviation landscape and also **act in synergy with existing technologies**

Sources: EGNOS Service Provision Yearly Report (ESSP), ICAO Navigation System’s Panel Expert Interview, Position Paper on SBAS (IATA-JURG); SBAS: A key enabler to PBN (DSNA/DGAC)
The relevance of Continental CBA being developed is stressed, as all previous CBAs have scope limitations, either geographical or stakeholder-related.

### Review of existing literature

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CBA Study</th>
<th>Results</th>
<th>Limitations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SBAS for AFI-CBA for Airlines (2020)</td>
<td>ROI: 767%</td>
<td>The study is limited to airlines and doesn’t consider ground-side users such as ANSPs and airport operators or the induced impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undiscounted benefits: 770 M€</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undiscounted costs: 89 M€</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undiscounted benefits: 1,774 M€</td>
<td>Doesn’t consider all the African continent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undiscounted costs: 361 M€</td>
<td>Doesn’t consider the induced impacts of SBAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preliminary Benefit Assessment of SBAS for Eastern African Module (2018)</td>
<td>Profit (NPV) for ANSPs and airport operators: 26 M€</td>
<td>Only considers Eastern Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Profit (NPV) for airspace users: 493 M€</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Profit (NPV) for State and Society: 1,140 M€</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: Introducing SBAS in Eastern Africa module (JPO); ESESA EGNOS Aviation CBA for AFI (LEK); SBAS for AFI-CBA for Airlines (AEGIS)
The combination of the geographical, airport and fleet submodels, allows a precise calculation of SBAS benefits and costs in Africa.

**CBA scenario definition**

1. All landings by all types of aircraft in Africa
2. Landings in countries covered by the African SBAS at a particular instance in the analysis timeframe
3. Landings in airports with LPV procedures at their runway ends
4. Landings by SBAS-equipped aircraft

Data gathering process compiled information from 23 African States, the rest of the inputs coming from SatNAV JPO and numerous databases (ICAO AFI eANP, AFRAA Annual Report, ICAO traffic forecast…).
SBAS can provide substantial operational benefits for both aircraft operators and ground-side users as well as positive environmental impact.

**SBAS benefits**

**Equipment rationalization**

SBAS can trigger progressive decommissioning of traditional ground aids to navigation (VOR, DMEs, NBDs) as well as ILS, reducing the operational and capital expenses of ANSPs and airport operators.

**Socio-environmental benefits**

The fuel savings derived from the airlines’ operational benefits can be monetized with the social cost of carbon.

**ILS at the opposite QFU**

- **Delays, Diversions and Cancellations**
  
  Persistently poor weather conditions or equipment unavailability could cause an aircraft to cancel the flight (cancellation) to head to an alternate airport (diversion) or to postpone the landing (delay).

  Pilot errors, equipment problems, poor weather conditions as well as navigational equipment issues may cause a CFIT or runway incidents, specially in airports non-equipped with ILS infrastructure.

**Landing at the opposite QFU – flight efficiency savings**

If only one of the runway headings is equipped with an ILS (or only one of them is active), the aircraft operator may have to perform unnecessary manoeuvres to adjust its trajectory to particular runway.
The airspace users benefit from the increased accuracy and integrity with flight efficiency, safety and DDC avoidance benefits, at the cost of fleet equipage.

### Cost-benefit identification and calculation mechanisms

- Mission savings / flight efficiency benefits
  - En route
  - Terminal Maneuvering Area (TMA)
  - Approach
- Delays, Diversions and Cancellations (DDC) avoidance
- Safety benefits
  - CFIT / Landing accident avoidance
  - Mid-air collision avoidance
- Aircraft SBAS Equipage
Ground side users invest in the SBAS infrastructure and benefit from equipment rationalisation as well as from DDC avoidance and increased flight efficiency

Cost-benefit identification and calculation mechanisms

- Equipment rationalization
- Benefits linked to DDC reduction and flight efficiency
  - Increased airport operational efficiency and saving on operating ATCO costs
  - Landing fees due to cancellations reduction
- Flight procedure development and publication
- SBAS infrastructure deployment and operations

The methodology, inputs and data sources used for all benefits and costs are included in the full CBA report
The business case for airlines is highly profitable, with a 545% ROI, 36% IRR, NPV of 287 M$ by 2045 and a 6-year payback period.

**CBA results and sensitivity analysis**

**Step 1: Financial Analysis**

**Benefit breakdown of SBAS implementation for African airside users (M$)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2023</th>
<th>2024</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2026</th>
<th>2027</th>
<th>2028</th>
<th>2029</th>
<th>2030</th>
<th>2031</th>
<th>2032</th>
<th>2033</th>
<th>2034</th>
<th>2035</th>
<th>2036</th>
<th>2037</th>
<th>2038</th>
<th>2039</th>
<th>2040</th>
<th>2041</th>
<th>2042</th>
<th>2043</th>
<th>2044</th>
<th>2045</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DDC</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MAC</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFIT</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TMA</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>En-r</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Cost breakdown of SBAS implementation for African airside users (M$)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>2021</th>
<th>2022</th>
<th>2023</th>
<th>2024</th>
<th>2025</th>
<th>2026</th>
<th>2027</th>
<th>2028</th>
<th>2029</th>
<th>2030</th>
<th>2031</th>
<th>2032</th>
<th>2033</th>
<th>2034</th>
<th>2035</th>
<th>2036</th>
<th>2037</th>
<th>2038</th>
<th>2039</th>
<th>2040</th>
<th>2041</th>
<th>2042</th>
<th>2043</th>
<th>2044</th>
<th>2045</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Retrofit costs</td>
<td>-9</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
<td>-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forwardfit costs</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Financial indicator**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Overall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative undiscounted benefits</td>
<td>662 M$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative undiscounted costs</td>
<td>103 M$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cumulative undiscounted cashflow</td>
<td>559 M$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPV (2045)</td>
<td>287 M$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return on Investment (ROI)</td>
<td>545%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Internal Rate of Return (F-IRR)</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Payback year</td>
<td>2028 (6 years)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Benefits are dominated by DDC events reduction and increased flight efficiency; while the majority of the costs are incurred during the ramp-up phase of aircraft retrofitting.
The business case of ground-side users, albeit positive, has lower returns than the case for airlines, with a 15% F-IRR, 21% ROI and 59 M$ NPV.

**CBA results and sensitivity analysis**

**Step 1: Financial Analysis**

### Benefit breakdown of SBAS implementation for African airside users (M$)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Benefit Breakdown</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2021</td>
<td>CAPEX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>OPEX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Landing fees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increased op.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Efficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ATCO savings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Cost breakdown of SBAS implementation for African ground-side users (M$)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Cost Breakdown</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2021</td>
<td>SBAS infrastructure CAPEX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SBAS infrastructure OPEX</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Flight procedures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The benefits of SBAS implementation are dominated by infrastructure rationalization (≈94%), due to decommissioning and avoided backlog, while 96% of the costs are related to SBAS infrastructure deployment.

Excerpts from DT Global as Support to AUC for Continental Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) on Satellite-Based Augmentation System (SBAS) Implementation in Africa.
The different dynamics in benefits and costs for both stakeholders lead to the same payback period of 6 years

CBA results and sensitivity analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ANSPs / airport operators</th>
<th>Aircraft operators</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - The benefits of SBAS for ground-side users are dominated by infrastructure rationalisation (decommissioning of old ILS equipment that will not be renewed due to the deployment of SBAS) | - The benefits of SBAS for airlines are driven by the following factors:  
  ▪ Progressive SBAS fleet ramp-up  
  ▪ Progressive coverage evolution in the successive SBAS evolutions  
  ▪ Increased traffic |
| - Although the CAPEX is incurred during the deployment phase (2022-2032), there is considerable OPEX expenses throughout the entire timeframe | - The costs are concentrated in the first periods, during the fleet ramp-up and the higher cost of retrofitting |
| - This is the reason why, although profitability is limited, the payback period is 6 years | - This is the reason why, although overall the benefits are much higher, the payback period is also 6 years |

Note: The increase of benefits related to accident avoidance are related to the increase in equipage, traffic and SBAS coverage. The model considers the efforts made in the last decade to increase safety at African airports and the decreased accident rates in the continent.

Excerpts from DT Global as Support to AUC for Continental Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) on Satellite-Based Augmentation System (SBAS) Implementation in Africa
All countries in Africa regardless of size can reap the benefits of SBAS technology, which will be dependent specially on traffic volumes and equipage at airports.

CBA results and sensitivity analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits by country [M$]</th>
<th>Unitary benefits by country [M$ of benefits per airport]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

- **Very high impact** (>20 M$ of benefits)
- **High impact** (>10 M$ of benefits)
- **Moderate impact** (>5 M$ of benefits)

When examining the **benefits by airport**, the distribution of countries more benefited by SBAS technology varies, with a **mix of large and small countries reaping the most benefits**.

All African countries are recipients of benefits from SBAS implementation. The degree of benefits is driven, among many other reasons by overall country traffic levels and ILS equipage at airports.
The SBAS system’s implementation in Africa on a continental scale is economically positive for all stakeholders under all the evaluated scenarios.

CBA conclusions and recommendations

1- SBAS implementation is economically attractive, with a 402 M$ NPV at 2045, E-IRR of 28%, ROI of 110% and a 5-year payback period.

2- The business case for airlines is extremely favorable, while for ANSPs and airport operators, the results are moderate due to the high deployment costs.

3- The carbon footprint of the project is highly positive, with net emission savings amount to 1,424 million kg of CO₂ over the analysis timeframe.

4- The sensitivity analysis has proved the robustness of the CBA against variations to the main input parameters.
Evaluation of seven market segments resulted in the selection of the Maritime and Agricultural markets as the two sectors to focus immediate CBA analysis.

### Market segment selection and applications identification in non-Aviation Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Markets</th>
<th>Evaluation Criteria</th>
<th>Market size</th>
<th>Market impact</th>
<th>Market conditions</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maritime</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drones</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geoinformation</td>
<td></td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LBS</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rail transportation</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Road and automotive</td>
<td></td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>✗</td>
<td>✔</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Criteria:** ✔ 2 pts ☺ 1 pt ✗ 0 pts

**Priority sectors:** Maritime, Agriculture
In both sectors, SBAS is expected to become a disruptive technology, with a highly positive market impact which can drive their development.

**Priority sector selection: Maritime and Agriculture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Maritime</th>
<th>Key market features</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The maritime market is expected to have around <strong>2.9 million SBAS-enabled operations by 2045</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- SBAS is expected to be a <strong>more cost-effective solution than other legacy GNSS-augmentation technologies</strong> in the sector (DGNSS beacons)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The <strong>improved accuracy and integrity</strong> for vessel navigation, positioning, collision avoidance and traffic management will <strong>positively impact both vessel operators and maritime authorities</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The <strong>market readiness</strong> in the maritime industry is already <strong>high</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key market features**

- Agriculture represents around **15% of the continents GDP** and employs two thirds of its population, so it is a critical market in African economy
- The SBAS market is expected to be very large, with **6.1 million operations** with **SBAS-equipped** machinery predicted by **2045**
- There are various applications, such as tractor guidance and variable rate application technologies for lower-value crops, in which **SBAS can act as an enabling technology and greatly boost the productivity of the sector**
The business case of SBAS for maritime stakeholders, including both vessel operators and authorities, is positive, with a 114 M$ NPV and 30% E-IRR.

**Business case development**

**Maritime**

### SBAS Benefits
- Operational efficiency savings and route opt.
- Improved safety

### SBAS Costs
- Fleet equipage

#### Vessel operators
- Infrastructure Capex and Opex savings
- Environmental benefits (CO₂ emissions reduction)

#### Mar. Authorities
- SBAS infrastructure deployment

**Economic results**

- E-IRR (2045) = 30%
- ROI = 126%
- NPV = 114 M$

**Description**

**Scope:** The business case is centred on the benefits of increased positioning and integrity provided by SBAS in general and coastal navigation and vessel positioning.

**Scenarios:**

- **Reference scenario:**
  - *Maritime authorities:* Current AIS stations located along the African coastline stations relay DGNSS corrections
  - *Vessel operators:* Fleet currently equipped with AIS transponders benefit from DGNSS

- **SBAS scenario:**
  - *Maritime authorities:* Incur in the costs to deploy SBAS infrastructure in the coastline
  - *Vessel operators:* Receive SBAS signal either directly from the satellites or from the coastal infrastructure

**Assumptions:** Detailed assumptions on the values used for the computation of the costs and benefits, are detailed in the Task 3 report.
The economic attractiveness of SBAS for agriculture is extremely high, and the enhanced positioning benefits can be disruptive for a key industry in Africa.

### Business case development

**Agriculture**

**Agricultural end users**

#### SBAS Benefits

- Fuel savings
- Input (seeds, fertilizer…) savings
- Time and labour savings

#### SBAS Costs

- Equipment equipage costs

### Economic results

- **E-IRR (2045) = 148%**
- **ROI = 1953%**
- **NPV = 395 M$**

### Description

**Scope:** The business case is centred on the use of SBAS for farm machinery guidance.

SBAS benefits are based on the improvement that the technology provides with respect to manual or standalone GNSS in terms of pass-to-pass accuracy, at the cost of equipage of the machinery.

**Scenarios:**
- **Reference scenario:** Unaided driving (most machinery in Africa is not GNSS-equipped)
- **SBAS scenario:** Manual (the operator has enhanced positioning but not autosteer)

**Assumptions:**
- The analysis is limited to lower value crops (wheat, maize, lentils, beans…) and extensive areas, in which tractors are used as opposed to other power sources (animals or humans)
- The pass-to-pass errors in agriculture are assumed to occur in overlaps, implying wastes of fuel, time and inputs (seeds, fertiliser…)
The results presented in this CBA are conservative, as only two priority sectors have been quantified and other potentially profitable markets are not considered.

**Business case development**

**SBAS Implementation**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority sectors</th>
<th>Leading sector</th>
<th>Other impacted sectors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quantitatively assessed</td>
<td>Quantitatively assessed</td>
<td>Qualitatively assessed</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key financial indicators**
Combining the results from both sectors with the outcomes of the Aviation CBA, the overall results of SBAS implementation for Africa are obtained.

Integration with aviation CBA and cost apportioning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E-IRR (2045)</th>
<th>ROI</th>
<th>NPV (2045)</th>
<th>Payback</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>34%</td>
<td>195%</td>
<td>930 M$</td>
<td>5 years</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall economic results of SBAS implementation for the African economy (M$)

Considering the accrued impact of aviation, maritime and agricultural markets, the SBAS CBA results for the entire African economy are extremely positive, even without considering other potential sectors (drones, geoinformation…)
Overall, the main conclusion drawn from the study is how the implementation of SBAS system in African is economically highly positive for the continent.

1- SBAS is a relevant technology across many sectors in the African industry, among which the **agricultural** and **maritime** markets stand out.

2- The **economic attractiveness of SBAS implementation has been demonstrated** for both agricultural and maritime stakeholders.

3- Considering the accrued impact of all three sectors, the overall **SBAS CBAS for Africa** results in an **NPV of 930 M$ at 2045**, with a **34% E-IRR, 195% ROI** and **5-year payback period**.

4- It is recommended to explore the option of involving stakeholders of other industries and **obtain governmental support**, providing the basis of SBAS social infrastructure with wide economic benefits.
Recommendations and Conclusions

- Presentations of DT Global Consultants as support to AUC for Continental Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) on Satellite-Based Augmentation System (SBAS) implementation in Africa was well received and appreciated by African Member States, regional & international organizations on 31st May, 2022.

- There is need for National telecoms regulatory authorities to manage the assignment of frequency spectrum to any service at national level to avoid harmful interferences with SBAS signals with particular attention to uplink signals.

- Need for African Institutions (i.e AUC and AFCAC) in collaboration with stakeholders and partners to develop governance and institutional framework for SBAS including financing models.

- Aviation States to continually support regional satellite service providers in the assignment of Pseudo Random Noise (PRN) code by the US Space Force for broadcast of SBAS signals in Africa and surrounding waters.
In addition to the key non-aviation applications that were considered in the study, stakeholders noted the importance and benefits of SBAS applications in other areas such as urban planning, precise geo-location information, cargo tracking systems, rail & road transport, drone applications etc.

It is recommended to explore options of involving other stakeholders in related industries and obtain governmental support in providing the basis of SBAS social infrastructure with wide economic benefits.

Specialized institutions and partners in Africa are encouraged to undertake capacity building and awareness activities for the applications of SBAS in aviation and non-aviation sectors.

Outcomes, comments and recommendations made during the workshop are to be submitted to African Union policy organs for considerations.

DOI: 10.1109/ICASTech.2011.6145156


NigComSat-1R. Preliminary design review (PDR) and critical design review (CDR) of NIGCOMSAT-1R Communications Satellite Project. Nigerian Communications Satellite Limited. Abuja, Nigeria: NIGCOMSAT-1R; 2009.


Excerpts from DT Global Presentation Slides Support to AUC for Continental Cost-Benefit Analysis (CBA) on Satellite-Based Augmentation System (SBAS) Implementation in Africa held at Marriott Hotel, Kigali, Rwanda on 30-31 May, 2022.